



Taylor, A., Tallon, D., Kessler, D., Peters, T. J., Shafran, R., Williams, C., & Wiles, N. (2019). An expert consensus on the most effective components of cognitive behavioural therapy for adults with depression: a modified Delphi study. *Cognitive Behaviour Therapy*.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/16506073.2019.1641146>

Peer reviewed version

License (if available):
Other

Link to published version (if available):
[10.1080/16506073.2019.1641146](https://doi.org/10.1080/16506073.2019.1641146)

[Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research](#)
PDF-document

This is the accepted author manuscript (AAM). The final published version (version of record) is available online via Taylor & Francis at <https://doi.org/10.1080/16506073.2019.1641146> . Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/red/research-policy/pure/user-guides/ebr-terms/>

Supplementary Materials - Additional File 1

Defining an expert consensus on the components of cognitive behavioural therapy most effective in bringing about clinically important change: a Delphi study

Table 3 – Items not achieving consensus for inclusion in Round 2

	Components not achieving consensus	<i>n</i> of respondents	Score 7-9 ⁺ <i>n</i> (%)	Score 1-3 ⁺ <i>n</i> (%)	Median (IQR)
Content Components	Agreeing a list of priority problems and goals	21	14 (66.7)	1 (4.8)	7 (6-8)
	Behavioural experiments to explore evidence for beliefs and assumptions	21	14 (66.7)	1 (4.8)	7 (6-8)
	Exposure techniques	21	13 (61.9)	3 (14.3)	7 (5-7)
	Exploring positive and negative reinforcers that maintain depressive behaviours	21	13 (61.9)	2 (9.5)	7 (6-8)
	Developing a formulation and using it to outline a treatment plan	21	12 (57.1)	2 (9.5)	7 (6-8)
	Providing the client with written worksheets to gather information, or practice new skills	21	12 (57.1)	3 (14.3)	7 (6-7)
	Using measures of symptoms or mood to guide therapy and monitor outcome (such as the Beck Depression Inventory, PHQ-9, mood or symptom rating scales or diaries)	21	12 (57.1)	3 (14.3)	7 (6-8)
	Using questions to help the client make his/her own discoveries (i.e. guided discovery and Socratic questioning)	21	10 (47.6)	0 (0)	6 (6-7)
	Managing difficult emotions and helping the client to test out the associated beliefs	21	9 (42.9)	1 (4.8)	6 (6-8)
	Psychoeducation about depression	21	9 (42.9)	1 (4.8)	6 (5-7)
	Identifying and challenging key cognitions including negative automatic thoughts	21	8 (38.1)	2 (9.5)	6 (5-7)
	Identifying and modifying	21	8 (38.1)	3 (14.3)	6 (5-7)

	conditional beliefs/underlying assumptions/rules for living				
	Providing a written summary of what was covered in each session - including goals for the period that follows	21	8 (38.1)	3 (14.3)	6 (5-7)
	Managing the ending of a course of therapy	21	7 (33.3)	1 (4.8)	6 (6-7)
	Creating a written agenda that is agreed collaboratively at the start of each session	21	6 (28.6)	4 (19.1)	5 (5-7)
	Identifying and challenging unhelpful thinking styles (e.g. all or nothing thinking)	21	6 (28.6)	3 (14.3)	6 (5-7)
	Identifying and modifying core beliefs	21	3 (14.3)	4 (19.1)	5 (4-6)
Process Components	Ensuring that the therapy provided adheres to a recognised CBT model for depression (e.g. Beckian CBT)	18	12 (66.7)	2 (11.1)	7 (6-8)
	Ensuring that the therapist receives regular supervision	18	11 (61.1)	0 (0)	7 (6-8)
	Ensuring that CBT is provided by a therapist who meets national standards for CBT training and practice	20	11 (55.0)	2 (10.0)	7 (5-7)
	Providing at least 6 sessions of CBT	18	9 (50.0)	3 (16.7)	6.5 (4-8)
	Scheduling CBT to take place at least once per week for the majority of the therapy	20	9 (45.0)	4 (20.0)	6 (5.5-7)
	Providing at least 12 sessions of CBT	18	7 (38.9)	3 (16.7)	6 (4-8)
	Providing additional support between CBT sessions by telephone, email and/or instant messaging	20	5 (25.0)	0 (0)	6 (5-6.5)
	Providing at least 16-20 sessions of CBT	18	4 (22.2)	6 (33.3)	5 (3-6)

	Providing CBT face-to-face rather than by telephone	18	3 (16.7)	7 (38.9)	5 (3-6)
	Providing advance reminders of sessions e.g. by text, email or letter	20	3 (15.0)	4 (20.0)	5 (4.5-6)

† Scoring for each component using Likert scale where 1 = not at all important; 9 = very important

Table 4 – Importance of written and/or online materials to support CBT components

Component	<i>n</i>	Score 7-9 ⁺ <i>n</i> (%)	Score 1-3 ⁺ <i>n</i> (%)	Mean (SD)
Planning and reviewing practice ('homework') assignments	18	14 (78.8)	2 (11.1)	6.8 (2.3)
Methods to prevent relapse	18	13 (72.2)	2 (11.1)	6.8 (1.9)
Psychoeducation about depression	18	13 (72.2)	3 (16.7)	6.8 (2.0)
Activity monitoring and scheduling	18	11 (61.1)	1 (5.6)	6.8 (1.7)
Explaining the model/rationale for CBT	18	11 (61.1)	1 (5.6)	6.8 (1.8)
Identifying and challenging key cognitions including negative automatic thoughts	18	10 (55.6)	4 (22.2)	5.6 (2.6)
Undertaking an initial assessment (including translating abstract complaints into concrete and discrete problems)	18	10 (55.6)	3 (16.7)	6.0 (2.1)
Agreeing a list of priority problems and goals	18	9 (50.0)	3 (16.7)	6.1 (1.9)
Developing a formulation and using it to outline a treatment plan	18	9 (50.0)	3 (16.7)	6.2 (2.3)
Eliciting feedback and adapting therapy based on feedback	18	9 (50.0)	3 (16.7)	5.9 (2.2)
Exploring positive and negative reinforcers that maintain depressive behaviours	18	9 (50.0)	4 (22.2)	5.8 (2.6)
Identifying and challenging avoidant behaviour	18	9 (50.0)	4 (22.2)	5.8 (2.5)
Behavioural experiments to explore evidence for beliefs and assumptions	18	8 (44.4)	4 (22.2)	5.7 (2.2)
Exposure techniques	18	8 (44.4)	4 (22.2)	5.5 (2.7)
Identifying and challenging unhelpful thinking styles	18	8 (44.4)	4 (22.2)	5.6 (2.5)
Managing difficult emotions and helping the client to test out the associated beliefs	18	8 (44.4)	4 (22.2)	5.7 (2.4)
Identifying and modifying conditional beliefs/underlying assumptions/rules for living	18	6 (33.3)	4 (22.2)	5.3 (2.2)
Creating a written agenda that is agreed collaboratively at the start of each session	18	4 (22.2)	7 (38.9)	4.6 (2.1)

Identifying and modifying core beliefs	18	4 (22.2)	4 (22.2)	4.9 (2.1)
--	----	----------	----------	-----------

† Scoring for each component using Likert scale where 1 = not at all important; 9 = very important